



Office of the City Auditor
Policies and Procedures

Number: 6.1.3

Title: Project Appraisals

Original Date: **Revision Date:** **Last Review Date:** **Approved By:**

01/27/1994 06/01/1996
08/02/2002
03/02/2009

I. Policy

- A. Each auditor shall receive a project appraisal:
 - 1. Every six months provided that the auditor charged 80 hours or more to the project in the corresponding six month timeframe.
 - 2. At the end of each project before closeout.
- B. For projects where an individual charged less than 80 hours, appraisals for that individual are optional.
- C. Each audit investigator shall receive a quarterly appraisal in lieu of separate project appraisals.

II. Purpose

- A. The purpose of this policy is to ensure that structured and timely communication is provided to all staff about their project performance.
- B. Separate project appraisals for Investigators are not feasible because of the relatively short duration and large number of projects worked.

III. Definitions

- A. **Auditor-in-Charge (AIC)** – The auditor who is tasked with leading an audit.

- B. **Closeout** – The thirty-day period after a project has been presented to Council. During this period, the audit team shall complete all tasks including remaining appraisals.
- C. **Project Appraisal** – A performance appraisal (see appropriate forms at the end of this policy) used to assess individual performance.
1. **Project Appraisal Form** – Used to assess auditor performance on a specific project. This form covers the eight performance categories (see Policy 6.1.1) and indicates whether the person being assessed has met, exceeded, or not met the expectations for each category. Each performance rating is justified with specific examples of performance and suggestions for improvement opportunities.
 2. **Upward Appraisal Forms** – Used to assess AIC and Assistant City Auditor (ACA) performance on a specific project. These forms use a Likert scale to assess either the evaluator's agreement with particular statements or the evaluator's perception of how often needed behaviors occur. These statements are intended to coincide with specific performance appraisal categories.
 3. **Audit Investigator Quarterly Appraisal Form** – Used to assess audit investigator performance on a quarterly basis. This form covers current and prospective expectations for the eight performance categories (see Policy 6.1.1) and indicates whether the person being assessed has met, exceeded, or not met the expectations for each category. Each performance rating is justified with specific examples of performance and suggestions for improvement opportunities.
- D. **Self-Assessment** – A Project Appraisal developed by the person being assessed.
- E. **Time Accounting System (TAS)** – OCA's internal database for inputting and reporting on hours billed to audit projects by staff.

IV. Procedures/Responsibilities

- A. Each Auditor and Audit Investigator is responsible to:
1. Monitor timeframes (using TAS as appropriate) for their projects and team members to determine when project appraisals are due.
 2. Provide team members with a project appraisal, as required, using the appropriate form:
 - a. For Audit Investigators, on a quarterly basis.
 - b. For Auditors, the AIC will provide a project appraisal and the team member will provide an upward appraisal:

- i. Every six months provided that the team member charged at least 80 hours to the project during the corresponding six month timeframe.
 - ii. At the end of the project before closeout.
 - c. If requested by a team member who has charged less than 80 hours on a project. An AIC or other supervisor may provide a project appraisal in this instance without receiving a request.
- B. Each team member has the option of preparing a self-assessment for discussion purposes.
- C. After both the Project Appraisal (or Audit Investigator Quarterly Appraisal) form and the appropriate Upward Appraisal form have been completed by the respective team members:
 1. The AIC (or CAIU Manager) will schedule and hold a meeting with the team member being evaluated to:
 - a. Discuss each performance category rated.
 - b. Provide justification for each rating.
 - c. Discuss improvement opportunities related to each of the categories.
 2. In the same meeting, but after discussion of the Project Appraisal (or Audit Investigator Quarterly Appraisal), the participants will discuss the Upward Appraisal.
 3. After the respective appraisals have been discussed, both participants will sign the documents to indicate that they have read and received the appraisal. The signatures do not signify agreement with the appraisal.
- D. After the appraisals have been signed, the AIC (or CAIU Manager) will provide the appraisal forms to the Administrative Assistant responsible for human resources functions (HRA). The HRA will file the appraisals in the appropriate personnel file and provide copies to the appropriate ACA.
- E. After an AIC has completed this process for all required project appraisals, the same process noted above will be followed with these changes:
 1. Duties assigned to the AIC will be assumed by the ACA.
 2. The ACA will complete a Project Appraisal form for the AIC and the AIC will complete the appropriate Upward Appraisal for the ACA.

-- This page left blank --

PROJECT APPRAISAL FORM

Name	Classification	Role
-------------	-----------------------	-------------

Project Number and Name

Period Covered

Assessment Ratings:

MEETS Expectations for Level and Zone

EXCEEDS Expectations for Level and Zone

DOES NOT MEET Expectations for Level and Zone

Internal Behavior

Meets _____ Exceeds _____ Does not Meet _____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

External Behavior

Meets _____ Exceeds _____ Does not Meet _____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

Project/Case Management

Meets _____ Exceeds _____ Does not Meet _____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

**Technical Capacity and
Professional Development**

Meets _____ Exceeds _____ Does not Meet _____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

Conceptualization

Meets _____ Exceeds _____ Does not Meet _____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

Outputs

Meets_____Exceeds_____Does not Meet_____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

Outcomes

Meets_____Exceeds_____Does not Meet_____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

**Office Capacity Building/
Management System
Improvement**

Meets_____Exceeds_____Does not Meet_____

Comments:

Improvement Opportunities:

I have presented and discussed this appraisal.

AIC

Date

I have read and received this appraisal.

Auditor/Audit Investigator

Date

**UPWARD APPRAISAL FORM
AUDITOR-IN-CHARGE**

Name	Classification
Project Number and Name	
Period Covered	

Please use the following rating scale:

1=Strongly Disagree

2=Disagree

3=Agree

4=Strongly Agree

N/A=Not Applicable

Internal Behavior

The AIC gave me constructive feedback on my work and behavior.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC completed my project appraisal in a timely manner.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC listened to my comments and suggestions.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC gave me the freedom to try things on my own.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC elicited ideas from the team.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC promoted and modeled a positive team environment.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC gave constructive advice for dealing with difficult team members.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC worked to defuse tension and conflict when warranted.	1	2	3	4	N/A

Project Management

The AIC performed work tasks.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC delegated project responsibilities to other team members when appropriate.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC effectively managed project schedules and timelines.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC set and reexamined priorities throughout the project.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC effectively dealt with problems that could impact project completion and success.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC provided coaching on developing work papers, conducting effective interviews, making presentations, meeting timelines, etc.	1	2	3	4	N/A

Technical Capacity and Professional Development

The AIC coached me in designing and applying methodologies.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC was a good resource for information on skills or methodologies.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC ensured that government auditing standards were followed during the project work.	1	2	3	4	N/A

Conceptualization

The AIC coached me through new concepts and responsibilities.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC communicated the vision/messages associated with the project.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC guided the team in selecting the appropriate objectives and methodologies.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The AIC helped the team identify key relationships among findings.	1	2	3	4	N/A

Output

The AIC facilitated/contributed to the quality of the product.

1 2 3 4 N/A

The AIC increased my understanding of what constitutes a quality output.

1 2 3 4 N/A

Comments:

AIC

Date

Auditor/Audit Investigator

Date

-- This page left blank --

**UPWARD APPRAISAL FORM
ASSISTANT CITY AUDITOR**

Name **Classification**

Project Number and Name

Period Covered

There are two rating scales below. Please use whichever enables you to best evaluate the ACA's behavior with regard to each statement.

Rarely, if Ever, even when Needed	1	Strongly Disagree
Sometimes, as Needed	2	Disagree
Most of the Time, as Needed	3	Agree
Always or Close to Always, as needed	4	Strongly Agree
Not Applicable or		Not Applicable or
Not Needed	N/A	Not Needed

You are strongly encouraged to write a comment for each section that summarizes your experience with the ACA in that category. Feel free to append one or more pages if the space provided is not adequate.

Internal Behavior

The ACA supported and encouraged effective teamwork.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA helped me to resolve conflict on the team.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA worked to motivate the team.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA modeled values and expectations that I am expected to uphold.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA gave appropriate recognitions when they were due.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA gave effective feedback on work and behavior.	1	2	3	4	N/A

Comments:

External Behavior

The ACA improved communications with outside stakeholders.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA negotiated with outside stakeholders for the common good, diffusing conflicts.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA helped the team negotiate or resolve external issues that impact project completion.	1	2	3	4	N/A

Comments:

Project/Case Management

The ACA promptly reviewed all work products.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA helped foresee and resolve timeline and resource conflicts that affected project management.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA completed appraisals in a timely manner.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA helped set my expectations.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA helped me set team expectations.	1	2	3	4	N/A
The ACA provided input to the planning of different phases of the project.	1	2	3	4	N/A

Comments:

Technical Capacity and Professional Development

The ACA actively contributed to my development as a team leader.	1	2	3	4	N/A
--	---	---	---	---	-----

The ACA encouraged me to contribute to the profession/professional organizations.	1	2	3	4	N/A
---	---	---	---	---	-----

The ACA was a resource for information, assistance, and advice.	1	2	3	4	N/A
---	---	---	---	---	-----

Comments:

Conceptualization

The ACA guided the development of project issues so that they were consistent with OCA's mission.	1	2	3	4	N/A
---	---	---	---	---	-----

Comments:

Outputs

The ACA provided valuable input to the project that resulted in a quality output.	1	2	3	4	N/A
---	---	---	---	---	-----

The ACA coached me on document review to achieve a quality output.	1	2	3	4	N/A
--	---	---	---	---	-----

Comments:

AIC

Date

ACA

Date

-- This page left blank --

**AUDIT INVESTIGATOR
QUARTERLY APPRAISAL FORM**

Audit Investigator	
Current Level	1.1
Quarter	
Date	

I have presented and discussed this appraisal.

ACA Signature

I have read and received this appraisal.

Audit Investigator Signature

Internal Behavior			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Listening, observing, learning, and supporting OCA/CAIU under direct supervision		Focus: Listening, observing, learning and supporting OCA/CAIU staff with assistance.
	1. Gains trust, respect, and confidence of team members.		1. Gains trust, respect and confidence of team members
	2. Assertive in expressing opinions and ideas to team members.		2. Assertive in expressing opinions and ideas to team members.
	3. Solicits, receives, and uses information from colleagues for improvement		3. Solicits, receives, and uses information from colleagues for improvement.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	

External Behavior			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Obtaining information under direct supervision; exhibiting courtesy and respect in interactions with others.		Focus: Obtaining information with assistance; exhibiting courtesy and respect in interactions with others.
	1. Learns to employ effective listening and interviewing skills.		1. Learns to employ effective listening and interviewing skills.
	2. Learns to gain trust, respect, and confidence of informants and friendly witnesses.		2. Learns to gain trust, respect, and confidence of informants and friendly witness.
	3. Maintains composure in stressful situations.		3. Maintains composure in stressful situations.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	

Project/Case Management			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Performing/Organizing tasks as assigned under direct supervision.		Focus: Performing/Organizing tasks as assigned with assistance.
	1. Produces documentation for integrity projects as assigned.		1. Learn to develop sufficient, competent, and relevant documentation for integrity projects.
	2. Ask for advice from project leader on how to perform, document and organize work.		2. Begins to organize, document, and perform own workload as assigned.
	3. Completes individual tasks in timely and effective manner.		3. Prioritizes assigned task to meet established deadlines.
	4. Sets and maintains high work standards for self.		4. Set and maintains high work standards for self.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	

Technical Capacity and Professional Development			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Learning and performing applicable methods/ techniques under direct supervision.		Focus: Recognizing and applying applicable method/techniques with assistance.
	1. Learns and applies established methodologies for project task.		1. Recognizes and applies established methodologies for project task.
	2. Learns and begins to apply principles of fraud examinations.		2. Recognizes and applies principles of fraud examinations.
	3. Learns basic elements of internal control.		3. With minimal assistance, collect data for assignments.
	4. Learns organization and functions of City departments.		4. Understands basic elements of internal control.
	5. With assistance, collect data for assignments.		5. Develops understanding of organization and functions of City departments.
	6. With assistance, learns to conduct simple analyses of data collected.		6. With minimal assistance conducts simple analyses of data collected.
			7. Explore developments of skills needed by CAIU.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	

Conceptualization			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Learning how discrete task contribute to project outcomes or unit objectives with assistance expected.		Focus: Learning how discrete task contribute to project outcomes or unit objectives with assistance.
	1. Learn characteristics of most common types of integrity violations.		1. Learn characteristics of most common types of integrity violations.
	2. Learn to identify evidence to prove or disprove integrity violations.		2. Learn to identify evidence to prove or disprove integrity violations.
	3. Learn to recognize key elements of management control.		3. Learn to recognize key elements of management control.
	4. Learn to identify steps to detect red flags.		4. Learn to identify steps to detect red flags.
	5. Become familiar with City organization and functions.		5. Become familiar with City organization and functions.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	

Outputs			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Produce internal outputs/documents for discrete task under direct supervision and with revision expected.		Focus: Produce internal outputs/documents for discrete task with assistance and with minimal revisions expected.
	1. Learn to prepare summaries (e.g., interview write-ups, tables, chronologies, and charts)		1. Prepare written summaries (e.g., interview write-ups, tables, chronologies, and charts)
	2. Learn to documents relevant background information.		2. Document relevant background information.
	3. Learn to verbally brief team on results of assignments.		3. Deliver verbal briefings during team meetings on results on assignments.
	4. Learn to conduct research to identify best practices approaches.		4. Conduct research to identify best practices approaches.
	5. Learn to conduct simple analyses f data/information.		5. Conduct simple analyses of data/information.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	

Outcomes			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Successful completion of tasks as assigned to support project objectives under direct supervision.		Focus: Successful completion of tasks as assigned to support project objectives with assistance.
	1. Assists lead investigator with projects that result in successful completion of project.		1. Assists lead investigator with concurrent projects that result in successful completion of projects.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	

Office Capacity Building/Management System Improvement			
✓	Current Level Requirements	✓	Prospective Level Requirements
	Focus: Participates in CAIU/OCA internal projects as assigned under direct supervision.		Focus: Participates in CAIU/OCA internal projects as assigned with assistance and oversight.
	1. Participate in improving CAIU/OCA systems by working on at least one internal project.		1. Participate in improving CAIU/OCA systems by working on at least one internal project.
	2. Become familiar with OCA policies.		2. Assists with writing new or revised policies.
	3. Provides information needed on other internal projects.		3. Provides information needed on other internal projects.
Comments			
Does Not Meet Expectations	Meets Expectations	Exceeds Expectations	